

## CABINET – 18TH MARCH 2010

### Report of the Director of Leisure and Environment

#### ITEM 21 MUSEUM SERVICE REVIEW

##### Purpose of the Report

To report on the scope, objectives and proposed outcome of the Museums Service Review and the target level of savings attributed in the service review.

##### Recommendations

1. That the proposals arising from the Museums Service Review be implemented, specifically:
  - Using Charnwood Museum staff rather than casuals to staff the Carillon
  - Closing Charnwood Museum on all Mondays throughout the year
  - Reducing the number of recitals at the Carillon by 26 per annum
2. That Delegated Authority be given to the Director of Leisure and Environment to carry out the staffing and operational changes required in order to implement these proposals.

##### Reasons

1. and 2. To enable the proposals arising from the service review to be implemented efficiently.

##### Policy

The proposals accord with the Council aims of **People Matter** and the minimised impact upon service levels accords with the aim of an **Excellent Council**.

##### Overview

The review is informed by the need to bring the Museum in line with park closure times in winter, to improve the staffing provision at the Carillon and to generate savings from the Carillon and Charnwood Museum to assist with the sustainability of both Museums while improving customer care and gallery maintenance. There is no opportunity to make further savings by including the Old Rectory as this service is delivered exclusively by volunteers.

##### Scope of the Service Review

The scope of this Service Review covers the following cost centres:

- T180 - Charnwood Museum
- L930 - Carillon

It should be noted that the Carillon is only included in this review as Charnwood Museum provides the operational management and staffing for the Carillon so it is intrinsically linked.

The **Museum Café** is currently delivered through a 3 year contract and there is no possibility of increasing the current level of income or hours of operation within the current arrangement.

The café contract has been tendered twice in recent years and the previous occupant only opened in the summer months refusing to open in the winter, this contract was terminated by mutual agreement. The current contract stipulates the minimum hours of opening which is currently exceeded so additional opening hours to deliver additional income could not be enforced without the agreement of the current contract holder. No changes were therefore proposed to this service area.

The **Old Rectory** is run as an Independent Museum by volunteers through a lease arrangement and the current budget barely covers maintenance and service costs. Further reduction would result in closure. Closure would not generate any significant savings as maintenance of the building would still need to be done and it could cost the Council significantly more as the lease requires the Historical Society to make the building available and look after the displays. This service was therefore not proposed for any changes in the review.

### **Charnwood Museum**

Charnwood Museum is a very popular free attraction providing a valued service and destination point complementing other attractions found in Queens Park. Against regional trends, the number of visitors to the Museum has increased in recent years to over 53,000 a year, including 3,000 school children. The service has achieved public satisfaction ratings of around 90%. The Museum has also maintained the Museums, Libraries and Archives Council Accreditation Scheme and achieved Quality Assured Visitor Attraction status and Charter mark. Background

The Museum staff provides Front of House services to customers at Charnwood Museum which is open to the public 7 days a week. Support and cover for Carillon staff is also provided.

There are currently 5 officers the Museums Manager (SCP 26) and Supervisor (Scale SCP 15) which are both full-time, and 3 part-time posts (SCP6/7).

The Museum is open all year round and is managed through a Service Level Agreement in partnership with Leicestershire County Council .

Mon – Sat 10.00 – 4.30

Sun 2.00 – 5.00 Summer 1.00 – 4.0

The Borough Council is responsible for the front of house staff, buildings and operations, while the County Council is responsible for the collections and their access and interpretation, along with associated activities and programming.

As well as the permanent exhibits providing local historical insight on Charnwood and its people, the Museum delivers a temporary exhibition programme, workshops, community events, and a very popular schools programme. The Museum also has Queens Park café in the main building which operates under contract with the Borough Council.

### **Carillon**

The Carillon is in the footprint of Charnwood Museum and a Service Level Agreement allows part of the building to be used as a war memorial museum staffed entirely by volunteers. Access to the tower and Carillon is supported by a casual member of staff employed by Charnwood Museum for the six months of the year along with the Carillonneur who provides recitals on Thursdays all year round and on Sundays from Good Friday to the end of September. Carillon Museum is currently open during summer months:

Mon – Sun 1.00pm – 4.30

**Old Rectory** – is managed independently by a charity known as the Loughborough archaeological and historical society on a lease arrangement for a basic rent of £60.00 per annum. The Council is responsible for the maintenance of the building and provides the charity with a nominal annual grant. The current arrangement is delivered by volunteers.

### **Principal options to be evaluated**

The following options were considered but as the savings could be met through efficiencies and the Museum review no further action is planned.

#### **1. No action**

Will not achieve the savings proposed.

#### **2. Close and sale of venue**

Would achieve saving but unlikely to achieve sale in current financial climate. In addition the Museum building is based in Queens Park and would need to operate within current park opening and closure times placing a further limitation on the site and potential sale.

The cost of decommissioning Charnwood Museum would have a negative impact on any potential income generation brought about through any sales and no savings could be achieved in the first 2 years.

#### **3. Sale/ contract venue to alternative provider**

A Service Level Agreement is currently in place with the County Council set up to protect the County Councils long term investment. The County Council currently provide all aspects of curatorial and educational support and associated expenditure therefore it is unlikely that an alternative provider would be able to meet the current level of Council subsidy already achieved and enjoyed through established partnership working.

#### **4. Carillon and Café**

As in the sections above, both were considered but would not realistically contribute to the potential savings, for the reasons stated above.

#### **5. Charging policy**

There is currently no charges levied at the museum. As this approach is in line with DCMS guidance, charging was not considered as an option. Should national guidance change, the museum service would naturally implement this, however there are no current plans to change national policy.

#### **6. Museums review**

This review was informed by the need to bring the Museum in line with park closure times in winter, to improve the staffing provision at the Carillon and to generate savings to assist with the sustainability of both Museums while improving customer care and gallery maintenance.

Although this will reduce the bottom line of the Carillon Budget the same staffing provision will be maintained at the Carillon but delivered by Charnwood Museum Staff and therefore eliminate the need for casual and temporary staffing. This is intended to drive up customer care and improve the current service offered and protect permanent staff by removing the casual staffing budget line.

The review will also require both Museum's to close on Mondays in line with National practice and a reduction in the number of Carillon guest recitals.

## **Changes proposed**

There are four main change proposed:

- Close Charnwood Museum earlier in winter months to be in line with park closure times
- No longer use casual staff to staff the Carillon and utilise Museum attendants instead
- Reduce the number of days the Museums (Charnwood and Carillon) are open to the public by one day to be more in line with the national trend, in order to make savings and improve service and sustainability of the service
- To reduce the number of Carillon recitals

The four changes proposed have been outlined below in detail along with the rationale for making these changes.

**Proposal One** - to close earlier in winter moving the closure time from 4.30pm to 3.00pm from October - March.

### **Rationale**

Queens Park is currently staffed by park rangers and in the winter their remit is to close the park gates at dusk. This can be as early as 3.00pm on days of poor visibility. This means that any visitor arriving at the park gates who wishes to enter the Museum cannot get access. The alignment of the earlier park closure time in winter with the Museum will assist with managing customer expectation and the opening hours of the Museum can be clearly displayed and published to avoid any disappointment and confusion of visitors.

It is also worth noting that visitor numbers in the Museum do decrease in winter in the last few hours of opening and based on last year's actual figures 3,900 users would be affected by closing at 3.00pm instead of 4.30pm.

**Proposal Two** - to use Charnwood Museum staff to open the Carillon and eliminate the need for casual and temporary staffing at the Carillon. This is intended to drive up customer care and improve the current service offered and protect permanent staff by offering up the casual staffing budget for the Carillon.

### **Rationale**

The Carillon is open to the public from Good Friday to the end of September. The current arrangement is to recruit casual staff each year to provide this service which is an unnecessary drain on resources. Due to the temporary nature of the appointments the casual staff employed at the Carillon can never operate at the same level as the Museum attendants and there is always a risk that the casual member of staff will leave before the end of the summer to find a permanent job which then necessitates the recruitment process to be repeated.

In order to improve the level of service at the Museum the proposal includes the incorporation of staff hours at the Carillon into the Museum's core staffing hours.

**Proposal three** - To Close Charnwood Museum and the Carillon on Mondays to the public to assist in the delivery of efficiency savings and the future sustainability of both Museums as major town attractions.

### **Rationale**

Closing Charnwood Museum on Mondays would not only deliver efficiency savings but it would also allow more time for staff to undertake essential cleaning and general maintenance and provide flexibility for staff training and development. The current arrangement is to

conduct all of the above in an hour before the Museum opens which is often difficult and problematic.

Last year just over 6,000 users attended the gallery on Monday but due to the high level of repeat users the impact would not be as great as the attendance figure. Monday is the preferred day because the usage on this day is one of the lowest and schools rarely book visits on Mondays. Monday traditionally has been a preferred day of closure for Museums nationally. Appendix A provides details of Charnwood Museum attendance.

As the Carillon staffing is dependant on being able to call on Museum staff if any problems arise e.g. antisocial behaviour or necessary breaks (Museum staff are in constant radio contact) it would be necessary for the Carillon to only open when Charnwood Museum is open or on special occasions when additional staff can be brought in.

**Proposal four** - To reduce the number of Carillon recitals played in order to assist in the delivery of efficiency savings and the future sustainability of both Museums as major town attractions.

#### Rationale

Currently the Carillonneur conducts 58 recitals a year, a further 26 recitals are delivered by guest Carillonneurs. A reduction of 26 recitals will assist in reducing the budget by £3,300 and will still allow a significant number of recitals to be played without affecting the number played by our resident player. The saving made by this proposal in conjunction with the above proposals will avoid permanent staff cuts while improving service deliver and customer care.

#### **What effect would this have on staff currently employed?**

It is proposed to incorporate the staff hours at the Carillon into the Museum's core staffing hours to improve the service and reduce the impact of the hours reduced on Museum staff. Being closed on Mondays will also allow time for staff to undertake essential cleaning and general maintenance and provide flexibility for staff training and development.

The proposal would involve annualised hours for 3 Museum assistants with less hours being worked in the winter months and would also require Museum assistants to staff the Carillon as well as Charnwood Museum. The duties conducted by Museum Assistants will not change when they are based at the Carillon so the JD and person spec has been amended to reflect the change of work locations only. It is envisaged that all staff will cover weekend work in line with the current staff contracts but this may increase in summer months due to opening two buildings.

#### Charnwood Museum rota

Two members of staff would be required as a minimum to open the Museum for public safety. The current available staff hours at the Museum excluding holidays/sickness and training has been assessed by finance and has been confirmed adequate.

#### Carillon rota

One member of staff has been programmed at the Carillon as this member of staff is supported by staff present at Charnwood Museum and there would also be on duty volunteers from the War Museum and at times the Carillonneur.

#### **Savings proposed**

Total savings proposed from the delivery of the 4 proposals will amount to approximately £11,000. A further £11,900 identified out side of the review through efficiency savings, reduction in energy consumption and other areas will total £22,900.

### Review savings

The Carillon is currently open for approximately 5.5 months of the year from Good Friday to September 30 allowing for 30 hours a week and a staffing budget of £7,500 for casual staff. This budget of £7,500 would be offered as a saving as the proposal is to staff the Carillon by permanent museum assistants currently working at Charnwood Museum. A further budget of £7,200 is used to support the Carillonneur recitals. By reducing the recitals from **84** to **58** a saving of £3,300 can be delivered making a total saving of £11,000.

### Cost of implementing the review

Charnwood Museum currently has a total staffing budget of £81,100. £1,500 is currently used to employ casual staff. The total museum staffing budget should match the new staffing rotas required.

The review will deliver a saving of £11,000 based on staff savings made by closing the Museums early in winter months and every day on Mondays.

To offset this saving of £11,000 by:

- Using Charnwood Museum staff instead of casuals freeing up a budget of £7,500
- No longer need to provide double time payment on the 3 Bank holidays that fall on a Monday
- Reduce staff expenditure of the Carillon by cutting down on the number of recitals played by guest Carillonneurs – reduction of 26 to **58** recitals = £3,500

### Who will be affected and how

The Proposal will directly affect the three Museum assistants who will be required to work more hours than currently contracted in the summer months and less in winter months and to work at the Carillon as well as Charnwood Museum. This will allow for the deletion of the casual staffing post at the Carillon. All staff will also be required to work at the weekends and in the summer - this will be more frequent as two buildings will need to be staffed.

#### **Current Staffing Position**

<b>T180</b>	<b>Post</b>	<b>Charnwood Museum</b>	<b>Annual Post hrs</b>
	L465	3 part-time Museum Assistants (18 hrs per week)	2808
	L473	Museum Supervisor (37 hours per week)	1924
	L474	Museum Manager (37 hours per week)	1924
		Casual staffing	
<b>L930</b>		<b>Carillon Tower (open Good Friday to end Sept only)</b>	
	H650	Carillon attendants (37 hours for 28 weeks)	1036
		Fees for Carillon Recitals	

#### **Proposed Staffing to cover both Services**

	New	3 part-time Museum Assistants (annualised hours)*	2808
	L473	Museum Supervisor (37 hours per week)	1924
	L474	Museum Manager (37 hours per week)	1924
		Casual staffing	
		Deleted Carillon attendants (37 hours for 28 weeks)	1036
		Fees for Carillon recitals (60 x £65)	

\* Annualised hours -

Part-time staff will work 20 hours April to September (Summer)  
 Part-time staff will work 11 hours October to March (Winter)  
 Also to retain 390 hours, Scale 2 (scp 13), to cover holidays, sick etc.

Financial Implications

Savings target

The indicative savings target for the Service set out in the Cabinet report of 26 November 2009 has been amended as Tourism was initially included in this review. Tourism has now been included in the Town Hall review because the Visitor Service Centre operates from this venue.

Based on the draft 2010/11 budget working papers the review aims to achieve £24, 000 savings this translates into a detailed savings target as follows:

Total savings proposed from the delivery of the proposals will amount to approximately £11,000. A further £11,900 through efficiency savings, reduction in energy consumption and other areas will total £22,900, with a final £1000 savings to be achieved through further small efficiencies around energy, office administration/ copying.

Consultation and communication requirements

Consultation has already taken place in line with the Councils Review Procedures including the Carillon staff and volunteers, and with the County Council staff, management.

Timeline and resourcing estimates

January 2010 – Feed back to staff result on consultation

Implementation - date April 2010

Risk Assessment

<b>Risk</b>	<b>Likelihood</b>	<b>Impact</b>	<b>Measures to address risk</b>
Failure to achieve the savings target	Low	Med	Proposed route addresses savings target and will continue to be monitored through ongoing performance monitoring of museum service.
Impact upon customer satisfaction and attendance numbers	Low	Med	The proposal is in line with a considerable volume of national and European practice, staff have monitored visitor numbers to identify the proposal with least impact, and will focus on customer initiatives

			on other opening hours to retain visitor numbers.
--	--	--	---

Key officer contacts

Chris Traill – Director of Leisure & Environment [chris.trail@charnwood.gov.uk](mailto:chris.trail@charnwood.gov.uk) 01509 634773

Sylvia Wright – Head of Arts Culture & Heritage, [sylvia.wright@charnwood.gov.uk](mailto:sylvia.wright@charnwood.gov.uk) 01509 634658