

Item No. 2

**Application Reference Number P/17/1982/2**

**Application Type:** Householder                      **Date Valid:** 02/10/2017  
**Applicant:** Mr & Mrs Mayo  
**Proposal:** Loft conversion and roof alterations to dwelling including front and rear dormers. Erection of garage to side/rear following demolition of existing garage. Revised scheme (Resubmission of P/16/2593/2 refers).  
**Location:** 4 Melton Road  
Barrow Upon Soar  
Leicestershire  
LE12 8NU  
**Parish:** Barrow Upon Soar                      **Ward:** Barrow and Sileby West  
**Case Officer:** Steven Holmes                      **Tel No:** 01509 634770

---

This item is being brought to Plans Committee as the application has been subject to a 'call in' from Cllr Fryer and Cllr Ranson for the following planning reasons:

- The impact on the conservation area
- The Village plan and design statement should have been considered to a greater extent by the applicant.
- The impact on the neighbours
- Parking – access and availability.

**Description of the Application**

The application site is a two storey detached property on the south-eastern side of Melton Road in Barrow upon Soar. The site is on a residential street and is located between the private driveway to No.17 Melton Road and the properties of 11 & 13 Melton Road to the southwest. No.15 Melton Road is also located to the rear.

The proposal consists of the following:

- 2x front facing dormer windows
- 1x replacement garage
- Roof extensions and alterations to facilitate a loft conversion. This includes rear northeast and southeast facing flat roof dormer extensions of modern design with Zinc cladding.

The front dormer windows will measure approximately 1.7m wide x 2m high x 2m deep (where measured along the ridge of the pitched roof) and will feature front facing gable ends.

The garage shall measure 4.06 m wide x 2.4 m high x 6.3m deep and will feature a flat roof with sedum planting upon it.

The roof alterations involve the raising of the roof by approximately 700mm where parallel with Melton Road and raising the roof by approximately 1m where the roof transitions to a south easterly facing gable end.

## **Development Plan Policies**

### Charnwood Local Plan Core Strategy (adopted 9th November 2015)

The following policies are relevant to this application:

Policy CS2 – High Quality Design – requires developments to make a positive contribution to Charnwood, reinforcing a sense of place. Development should respect and enhance the character of the area, having regard to scale, massing, height, landscape, layout, materials and access, and protect the amenity of people who live or work nearby.

Policy CS/14 – Heritage – requires developments to protect and enhance the heritage assets of the borough for their own value and the contribution they make to the community, the environment and the economy.

### Borough of Charnwood Local Plan (adopted 12th January 2004) (saved policies)

The policies relevant to this proposal include:

Policy EV/1 – Design – seeks to ensure a high standard of design that respects the character of the area and is compatible in mass, scale and layout.

Policy H/17 – Extensions to Dwellings – should not be detrimental to visual amenity or to the amenities of occupiers of nearby properties.

Policy TR/18 - Parking Provision in New Development notes that planning permission will not be granted for development, unless off-street parking for vehicles, including cycles, and servicing arrangements are included, to secure highway safety and minimise harm to visual and local amenities.

## **Other material considerations**

### National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

The NPPF states that the purpose of the planning system is to contribute to the achievement of sustainable development (para.6), fulfilling an economic, a social and an environmental role (para.7). Planning law requires that applications for planning permission must be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise (para.11). The NPPF states that the government attaches great importance to the design of the built environment and that good design is a key aspect of sustainable development (para.56). Planning decisions should not attempt to impose architectural styles or tastes but should seek to reinforce local distinctiveness (para.60). Permission should be refused for development of poor design that fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality of an area and the way it functions (para.64).

### Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on House Extensions

This SPG provides advice about the way planning applications for house extensions will be assessed. This includes guidance on the design and appearance of extensions and their impact on the enjoyment of neighbouring properties.

### Supplementary Planning Document Leading In Design

This document seeks to encourage, promote and inspire higher design standards in new development.

### Barrow Upon Soar Conservation Area Character Appraisal

The purpose of this appraisal is to examine the historical development of the Conservation Area and to describe its present appearance in order to assess its special architectural and historic interest. The appraisal is then used to inform the consideration of management and development proposals within the Area

### The Barrow upon Soar Neighbourhood Plan

This Plan, submitted in March 2017, has been the subject of independent examination in May/June 2017 with the Examiner's report published in June 2017. A modification to one of the policies which relates to the road network has required a further round of consultation which closed on the 16th November 2017. The Borough Council will then take a decision on the Examiner's recommendations before subjecting the plan to referendum and, ultimately, making it as part of the development plan. The neighbourhood plan should be given some weight as it has been through one round of consultation and the Examiner's report has been received with a recommendation that the Barrow upon Soar Neighbourhood Plan should proceed to a referendum subject to modifications. However, full weight will only apply upon completion of a successful referendum and the document being adopted as part of the development plan.

In terms of design, Policy BuS6 Design requires new development to reflect the guidance in the Barrow upon Soar Village Design Statement.

Barrow-upon-Soar Village Design Statement identifies the village's valued visual features and physical qualities and sets out guidelines for new development.

Neither the above Neighbourhood policy, or the village design statement will be affected by the proposed modifications.

### **Relevant Planning History**

P/16/2593/2 - Loft conversion and roof alterations to dwelling including front and rear dormers, and erection of replacement detached garage to side/rear.

## Responses of Statutory Consultees

### Barrow Parish Council

Object to the proposal on the grounds summarized below as:

- The proposal would be over dominant in the conservation area.
- There is a lack of parking provision.
- The proposal would result in a loss of privacy to the neighbours

## Other Comments Received

### Ward Councillors Ranson and Fryer

Object for the reasons summarised below:

- The impact on the conservation area
- The Village plan and design statement should have been considered to a greater extent by the applicant.
- The impact on the neighbours
- Parking – access and availability

### Barrow Heritage Group

Raise concerns as they do not consider the proposal adheres to the village design statement on the following paragraphs:

4.3 states that disruptive projections should be avoided,

4.10 Chimneys are particularly important and where possible these should be retained

4.22 Additions to existing properties should respect the architectural character of the existing building.

### Neighbour Comments

We have received 24 letters of objection from the following residents:

1 Wishbone Lane, Mountsorrel
109 Melton Road
11 Highfields
12 New Street
125 Sileby Road
16 Elm Tree Gardens, Stoneygate
161 Conway Drive, Shepshed
17 South Street
2 Mill Lane
24 Branston Avenue
25 The Lime kilns
32 Thirlmere Road
37 New Street
38 High Street
40 Church Street
41 Wicket Close
43 Martin Avenue
47 Beveridge Street
5 Clifton Court, Exeter
6 Nottingham Road
7 South Street

Proctors Park
Salt Box, Point, Deroran, Truro

A summary of the concerns raised in these objection letters are set out below:

- Effect upon the character and appearance of the conservation area
- Effect upon the character and appearance of the street scene
- Scale of the proposal
- Loss of Light
- Design and materials used for the proposal
- Privacy upon neighbouring properties
- Parking

The impact of the development during construction was also raised as a concern, however, this is not a material planning consideration.

One letter of support for the proposal has been received.

The supporter considers the proposal conforms to paragraphs 1.4, 1.5, 4.23 and 4.24 of the Village Design Statement and supports the proposal in relation to correctly designed contemporary structures in conservation areas.

Full copies of all correspondence received are available on the planning file and viewable via the Borough Council's website.

### **Consideration of the Planning Issues**

The main issues to be considered in the determination of this application are:

- i) The impact on the character and appearance of the street scene;
- ii) The impact on the amenity of occupants of neighbouring properties;
- iii) The impact on the highway
- iv) The impact upon the heritage assets.

#### The impact on the character and appearance of the street scene

The proposed garage will be significantly obscured from the street scene by No.4 Melton Road and the neighbouring properties. It will be set back from the highway by some 5.84 meters and features a flat Sedum roof (which is a green planted roof usually using species from the Sedum family). Views of the structure will as a result of the setback be limited to when viewed from directly in front of the proposal. It will replace a structure of similar design and scale (when viewed from the highway) and has the benefit of providing a usable parking space which is not available at the moment as the existing garage is too small. It is considered having regard to the softening effect of the Sedum roof and the setback position that the garage as proposed will not result in a detrimental impact on the street scene.

The front dormer extensions on to Melton Road will be visible from within the Street, however, similar features can be viewed elsewhere on Melton Road, for example at Chestnut Place.

It is considered the front dormers are of traditional appearance and it is noted that they will be made using matching materials to the host dwelling and are of relatively

small scale. It is considered that this allows them to be a subtle addition to the street scene

The rear dormer extensions are more contemporary in their appearance featuring a flat roof design and using zinc materials with larger swathes of glass. However, they will be located to the rear of the dwelling thus limiting the visual impact from the public highway. It is acknowledged that the rear dormers will be visible from Melton Road, when travelling against the direction of traffic as a pedestrian might, along the one way road. However, it is considered that the transition from render to zinc materials above eaves height helps the proposal to appear in similar proportions to the normal roof line, as the colour of the zinc assimilates well with the existing roof tiles which will remain on the property.

From the street scene, the roof shall be raised by 0.7 metres but will maintain the same pitched design with side facing gables. Other examples are present in the vicinity of similar steep pitches, and it is not therefore considered that the proposal will be out of keeping in terms of roof design. The proposed design is therefore considered compliant with policies CS2, EV/1 & H/17.

Consideration has been given to the concerns that the applicant should have had greater regard to the Village Design Statement on their submission. The application has been considered having regard to the impact on the character and appearance of the street scene as indicated above and as alluded to in the Heritage impact section of this report and is considered acceptable for the reasons set out above and in the Heritage impact section of the report having regard to the Village Design Statement.

#### The impact on the amenity of occupants of neighbouring properties

##### *Impact on no. 11 & 13 South Street*

The element of the proposal which will be most apparent to these dwellings will be the raised roof and the proposed garage. The other elements of the proposal will be significantly obscured from view by the existing structure and will therefore have a limited impact.

The proposed garage will remain the same 2.4 metres height as the existing structure and therefore no additional impact is considered to be caused upon these properties in this respect. The garage will be extended to the rear, however, this will be behind a wall that measures approximately 2m in height which is situated on a significantly higher ground level than the proposal. As such the increased length of the garage will not be apparent to these neighbouring properties and therefore any effect is considered to be minimal.

Although the roof of the house will be raised, the structure remains at a two storey scale and it is not considered that a 0.7 metre difference to the pitch will cause a significant overbearing impact to these neighboring properties.

Additionally the application site is to the north of the dwellings at No.11 and 13 South Street. Given the orientation and the scale of the alterations proposed it is considered that the proposal would not cause a significant loss of light.

#### *Impact on no.15 South Street*

This dwelling is located some 14 metres from the nearest potentially visible works, however, the rear garden does run along the rear boundary of the application site.

The potential for overlooking of the rear amenity space belonging to No.15 South Street is limited as it is significantly lower than that of the application site. It is also located behind a 1.5 metre (approx.) high boundary wall, where measured from the ground level of No.4 Melton Road. As such, the proposed works are not considered to cause a significant degree of over-looking due to the differing land level and boundary treatments. Furthermore, the works would not directly overlook the garden area closest to number 15 which is considered to be the most important part of the rear amenity space. This consideration has regard to advice contained in Charnwood Borough Council's House Extensions Supplementary Planning Guidance.

#### *Impact on no.17 South Street*

No.17 South Street is located directly to the rear of the proposed works and also has its main access running parallel with the northern boundary of the application site.

The dwelling at this address is separated from the dwelling at No.4 Melton Road by some 28 metres at the closest point and at least 32.5 metres from the location of the rear dormers. The 32.5 metre distance from the rear dormers ensures that the proposal exceeds the 21 metres separation distance between main habitable room windows to avoid privacy concerns as per the Leading in Design Supplementary Planning Document. It is also worth noting that the proposal also exceeds the separation distance for a three storey dwelling which would be 27.5 metres.

As such, it is not considered that the proposal will cause an impact upon privacy even when considering the substantially glazed nature of the proposed works.

#### *Impact on no.1 Melton Road*

This dwelling is located opposite the front elevation of No.4 Melton Road with the front facing windows already overlooked by the property. It is not considered that the proposed front dormers will cause significant additional over-looking. In addition the easterly direction of this elevation and the relatively small change when viewed from this dwelling, ensures that no significant loss of light would be experienced by the occupants of this property either.

#### *Impact on other properties*

The proposal is not considered to have any significant impact on any further properties.

For the above reasons, on balance, the proposed alterations are considered to comply with policy CS2 and H/17 and the advice contained within the adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance 'House Extensions, and would not have a significantly detrimental impact on neighbour amenity.

### Impact on the highway

An increase in bedrooms to five would ordinarily require three spaces to be provided to meet the requirements set out in the 6C's design guide by Leicestershire County Council. However, where the application site is close to services and amenities this requirement can be lower. There is currently 1 space present on the site which meets the size requirements as also set out in the 6C's Design Guide.

The proposal would result in an increase in the number of usable parking spaces within the site from 1 to 2 on account of the original garage being too small to be considered a viable parking space whereas the new garage would exceed the preferable size requirements of 6 metres by 3 metres advised by the Local Highway Authority. As such, it is considered that providing a condition is imposed requiring the parking to be provided by the new garaged to be retained, there will be a net increase in parking spaces. This change accompanied with the proximity to the village centre amenities and the nearby railway station and bus stops, allow the proposal to meet the requirements of the 6C's design guide and would therefore not be considered to have adverse impact on highway safety thus complying with policy TR/18. The proposal is also considered to comply with paragraph 32 of the NPPF which states that development should only be prevented or refused on transport grounds where the residual cumulative impacts of development are severe. For the reasons set out above the impact is not considered to be severe.

### Impact upon the heritage asset

The building is located in a prominent position within the Barrow Conservation Area and is afforded this prominence by the open aspect across the railway bridge to the east. However the building itself is not significant in heritage terms. It is a late 19th century house with simple distinctive architectural detailing to the front façade. Other elevations do not have any distinctive architectural details. It is therefore the front façade and the overall form of the building that are of heritage significance and contribute to the character of the conservation area.

The proposal seeks to introduce a contemporary extension over three floors attached to the internal corner between the rear of the principal block and the building's rear wing. It is a cohesive modern architectural element that stitches into the existing building fabric to create considerable visual interest to a part of the building which is architecturally bland. The choice of materials and architectural detailing has been carefully considered to contrast but complement the existing building materials.

The new extension will be visible from various part of the conservation area, particularly the east elevation from views over the railway. It will add to the eclectic mix of architectural styles which make up the character of the conservation area, and has not been designed to be harmonious but to introduce a distinctive form of architecture that contributes to the variety of buildings.

The use of sustainable green roofs to both the single storey element of the extension and the garage is considered to be beneficial.

Accordingly, it is considered the proposal will not result in harm to the character and the significance of the heritage asset which is the Barrow upon Soar conservation area and it is considered the proposal therefore complies with Core Strategy Policy CS14, the Barrow upon Soar Village Design Statement, the Barrow upon Soar Neighbourhood Plan and paragraphs 133 to 134 of the NPPF.

## **Conclusions**

In summary, the proposed development is considered to be acceptable in its design and appearance and impact on the street scene. The proposal is not considered detrimental to the amenities of neighbouring residential properties and would not cause significant loss of light to habitable rooms at the neighbouring properties. There is also not considered to be any significant impact on the highway from the current circumstances and while the materials and design are of a contemporary nature they are not considered to harm the Barrow Upon Soar Conservation Area.

It is therefore recommended that planning permission should be granted, subject to conditions.

## **RECOMMENDATION:-**

Grant Conditionally

1. The development, hereby permitted, shall be begun not later than 3 years from the date of this permission.

REASON: To comply with the requirements of Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act, 1990, as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans and documents:

- Application Form - received by the Local Planning Authority on 02 October 2017.
- Design and Access Statement - received by the Local Planning Authority on 02 October 2017.
- Site Plans – Job No: WA180 Drawing No: 1 - received by the Local Planning Authority on 02 October 2017.
- Proposed Plans – Job No: WA180 Drawing No: 10 REV: B - received by the Local Planning Authority on 02 October 2017.
- Proposed Elevations – Job No: WA180 Drawing No: 12 REV: B - received by the Local Planning Authority on 02 October 2017.

REASON: For the avoidance of doubt and to define the terms of the permission

3. Two parking spaces which measure a minimum of 5.5 metres by 2.4 metres where external or 6 metres by 3 metres where incorporated in to a garage building, shall be laid out, hard surfaced and made available for use upon completion of the loft conversion, hereby permitted. Those areas shall not thereafter be used for any purpose other than the parking of vehicles and for servicing.

REASON: To ensure that adequate off-street parking is provided and maintained, in the interests of road safety.

The following advice notes will be attached to a decision

1. DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES RELEVANT TO THIS DECISION - Policies CS2 of the Charnwood Core Strategy (adopted 9th November 2015) and EV/1, H/17 and TR/18 of the Borough of Charnwood Local Plan (adopted 12th January 2004) have been considered in reaching a decision on this application. The proposed development complies with the requirements of these policies and there are no other material considerations which are of significant weight in reaching a decision on this application.
2. Planning permission has been granted for this development because the Council has determined that it is generally in accord with the terms of the above-mentioned policies and the Council's adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance on House Extensions.
3. Discussion with the applicant to seek an acceptable solution was not considered necessary in making this decision. The Local Planning Authority has therefore acted pro-actively to secure a sustainable form of development in line with the requirements of the National Planning Policy Framework (paragraphs 186 and 187) and in accordance with The Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015.

